Inter-dimensional degeneracies in van der Waals clusters

Peter Nightingale

nightingale@phys.uri.edu

Department of Physics Kingston, RI 02881, USA

• Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of S-states of N particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in N - 1 and N + 1 spatial dimensions.

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of S-states of N particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in N 1 and N + 1 spatial dimensions.
- We derive this result exactly by showing that for spatial dimension $D \ge N 1$ the Schrödinger equation can be transformed into an differential equation with the D as a parameter.

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of S-states of N particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in N 1 and N + 1 spatial dimensions.
- We derive this result exactly by showing that for spatial dimension $D \ge N 1$ the Schrödinger equation can be transformed into an differential equation with the D as a parameter.
- D appears only in an effective potential that is symmetric in D about D = N.

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of S-states of N particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in N 1 and N + 1 spatial dimensions.
- We derive this result exactly by showing that for spatial dimension $D \ge N 1$ the Schrödinger equation can be transformed into an differential equation with the D as a parameter.
- D appears only in an effective potential that is symmetric in D about D = N.

MTEX with prosper.sty does it all.
(prosper.scourceforge.net)

• N atom cluster in D dimensions; positions given by $D \times N$ matrix of Cartesian coordinates

$$\mathbf{R}=(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\ldots\mathbf{r}_N),$$

with

$$\mathbf{r}_i = \left(\begin{array}{c} x_{1i} \\ \vdots \\ x_{Di} \end{array}\right).$$

• N atom cluster in D dimensions; positions given by $D \times N$ matrix of Cartesian coordinates

$$\mathbf{R} = (\mathbf{r}_1 \mathbf{r}_2 \dots \mathbf{r}_N),$$

with

$$\mathbf{r}_i = \left(\begin{array}{c} x_{1i} \\ \vdots \\ x_{Di} \end{array}\right).$$

Define difference vectors and their lengths

$$\mathbf{r}_{ij} = \mathbf{r}_j - \mathbf{r}_i,$$

 $r_{ij} = |\mathbf{r}_{ij}|.$

• Dimensionless Hamiltonian of N bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass μ

$$H = -\frac{1}{2m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_i^2 + \sum_{(i,j)} V(r_{ij}),$$

• Dimensionless Hamiltonian of N bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass μ

$$H = -\frac{1}{2m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_i^2 + \sum_{(i,j)} V(r_{ij}),$$

• with

$$\nabla_i^2 = \sum_{\alpha=1}^D \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^2}$$

• Dimensionless Hamiltonian of N bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass μ

$$H = -\frac{1}{2m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_i^2 + \sum_{(i,j)} V(r_{ij}),$$

• with

$$\nabla_i^2 = \sum_{\alpha=1}^D \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^2}$$

• Dimensionless Lennard-Jones potential V

$$V(r) = \frac{1}{r^{12}} - \frac{2}{r^6}$$

Dimensionless Hamiltonian of N bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass μ

$$H = -\frac{1}{2m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_i^2 + \sum_{(i,j)} V(r_{ij}),$$

• with

$$\nabla_i^2 = \sum_{\alpha=1}^D \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^2}$$

Dimensionless Lennard-Jones potential V

$$V(r) = \frac{1}{r^{12}} - \frac{2}{r^6}$$

• Inverse dimensionless mass is $m^{-1} = \hbar^2/2^{\frac{1}{3}} \mu \sigma^2 \epsilon$ proportional to the square of the de Boer parameter[1]; ϵ and σ the standard Lennard-Jones parameters. [J. de Boer, *Physica*, 14, 139 (1948)]

• Generate a sample of configurations \mathbf{R}_{σ} ($\sigma = 1, ..., s$) from a relative probability density function $\psi_g(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2$.

- Generate a sample of configurations \mathbf{R}_{σ} ($\sigma = 1, ..., s$) from a relative probability density function $\psi_g(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions β_i with non-linear variational parameters.

- Generate a sample of configurations \mathbf{R}_{σ} ($\sigma = 1, ..., s$) from a relative probability density function $\psi_g(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions β_i with non-linear variational parameters.

• Re-weighted functions defined as $\hat{\beta}_i(R) = \psi_g(R)^{-1}\beta_i(R)$ and $\hat{\beta}'_i(R) = \psi_g(R)^{-1}H\beta_i(R)$ for least-squares.

- Generate a sample of configurations \mathbf{R}_{σ} ($\sigma = 1, ..., s$) from a relative probability density function $\psi_g(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions β_i with non-linear variational parameters.
- Re-weighted functions defined as $\hat{\beta}_i(R) = \psi_g(R)^{-1}\beta_i(R)$ and $\hat{\beta}'_i(R) = \psi_g(R)^{-1}H\beta_i(R)$ for least-squares.
- In theory, for a complete set of elementary basis functions β_i the Schrödinger equation becomes

$$\hat{\beta}_i'(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) = \sum_{j=1}^n \hat{\beta}_j(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) \mathcal{E}_{ji}.$$

- Generate a sample of configurations \mathbf{R}_{σ} ($\sigma = 1, ..., s$) from a relative probability density function $\psi_g(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions β_i with non-linear variational parameters.
- Re-weighted functions defined as $\hat{\beta}_i(R) = \psi_g(R)^{-1}\beta_i(R)$ and $\hat{\beta}'_i(R) = \psi_g(R)^{-1}H\beta_i(R)$ for least-squares.
- In theory, for a complete set of elementary basis functions β_i the Schrödinger equation becomes

$$\hat{\beta}_i'(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) = \sum_{j=1}^n \hat{\beta}_j(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) \mathcal{E}_{ji}.$$

In practice, solve for matrix \mathcal{E} in least-squares sense on Monte Carlo sample. Reproduces stationarity of energy w.r.t. linear parameters for infinite sample.

• Optimal linear combinations of the basis functions β_i computed by spectral decomposition of \mathcal{E} :

$$\mathcal{E}_{ij} = \sum_{k=1}^{n} d_i^k \tilde{E}_k \hat{d}_j^k$$

with \hat{d}_i^k and d_i^k left and right eigenvectors of \mathcal{E} with eigenvalues \tilde{E}_k .

• Optimal linear combinations of the basis functions β_i computed by spectral decomposition of \mathcal{E} :

$$\mathcal{E}_{ij} = \sum_{k=1}^{n} d_i^k \tilde{E}_k \hat{d}_j^k$$

with \hat{d}_i^k and d_i^k left and right eigenvectors of \mathcal{E} with eigenvalues \tilde{E}_k .

• Yield: trial functions

$$\tilde{\psi}^k = \sum_{i=1}^n d_i^k \beta_i.$$

• Non-linear parameters of the β_i are optimized by minimizing the variance of the local energy of the linearly optimized $\tilde{\psi}^k$

$$\chi^2 = \frac{\sum_{\sigma=1}^s [\hat{\psi}^{k\prime}(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) - \tilde{E}_k \hat{\psi}^k(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})]^2}{\sum_{\sigma=1}^s \hat{\psi}^k(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2},$$

where
$$\hat{\psi}^k = \psi_g^{-1} \tilde{\psi}^k$$
 and $\hat{\psi}^{k\prime} = \psi_g^{-1} H \tilde{\psi}^k$.

• Non-linear parameters of the β_i are optimized by minimizing the variance of the local energy of the linearly optimized $\tilde{\psi}^k$

$$\chi^2 = \frac{\sum_{\sigma=1}^s [\hat{\psi}^{k\prime}(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) - \tilde{E}_k \hat{\psi}^k(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})]^2}{\sum_{\sigma=1}^s \hat{\psi}^k(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2},$$

where $\hat{\psi}^k = \psi_g^{-1} \tilde{\psi}^k$ and $\hat{\psi}^{k\prime} = \psi_g^{-1} H \tilde{\psi}^k$.

 For each choice of the <u>non-linear</u> parameters, new optimized <u>linear</u> parameters have to be computed:

• Non-linear parameters of the β_i are optimized by minimizing the variance of the local energy of the linearly optimized $\tilde{\psi}^k$

$$\chi^2 = \frac{\sum_{\sigma=1}^s [\hat{\psi}^{k\prime}(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}) - \tilde{E}_k \hat{\psi}^k(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})]^2}{\sum_{\sigma=1}^s \hat{\psi}^k(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma})^2},$$

where $\hat{\psi}^k = \psi_g^{-1} \tilde{\psi}^k$ and $\hat{\psi}^{k\prime} = \psi_g^{-1} H \tilde{\psi}^k$.

- For each choice of the <u>non-linear</u> parameters, new optimized <u>linear</u> parameters have to be computed:
- full optimization of <u>all</u> parameters consists of a linear optimization nested in a non-linear one.

Numerical results: three-body case

	Kr ₃		Ar ₃		$\frac{1}{2}$ -Ne $_3$	
D	E_1	ΔE_1	E_1	ΔE_1	E_1	ΔE_1
1	-1.872 548 547 6	-9×10^{-1}	-1.734 808 71	-8×10^{-1}	-0.895 584	-4×10^{-1}
2	-2.760 461 351 5	2×10^{-10}	-2.552 953 22	-1×10^{-9}	-1.302 484	-7×10^{-7}
3	-2.760 555 278 7	6×10^{-10}	-2.553 289 43	1×10^{-8}	-1.308 442	9×10^{-6}
4	-2.760 461 351 3	-5 ×10 ⁻¹¹	-2.552 953 22	-1×10^{-9}	-1.302 483	-2×10^{-6}
5	-2.760 179 569 8	-1×10^{-9}	-2.551 944 61	-2×10^{-8}	-1.284 627	-1×10^{-5}
6	-2.759 709 937 6	5×10^{-10}	-2.550 263 64	7×10^{-9}	-1.254 901	5×10^{-6}

Ground state energies E_1 (with errors in the last significant digit) and deviations from

quadratic fits ΔE_1 for Kr₃, Ar₃ and $\frac{1}{2}$ -Ne₃ in dimensions D = 1 through D = 6.

Numerical results: four-body case

D	E_1	ΔE_1
1	-2.625 622 56	-2×10^{-0}
2	-4.329 517 95	-8×10^{-1}
3	-5.118 <mark>146 05</mark>	-2×10^{-9}
4	-5.118 653 84	3×10^{-9}
5	-5.118 <mark>146 05</mark>	-2×10^{-9}
6	-5.116 622 70	1×10^{-9}

Ground state energies (with errors in the last significant digit) and deviations from

quadratic fits ΔE_1 for Ar₄ in dimensions D = 1 through D = 6.

Numerical results: excited states Ar₃

k	D = 2	D=3	D=4
2	-2.249 <mark>860 2</mark>	-2.250 185 5	-2.249 <mark>860</mark>
3	-2.126 <mark>038 8</mark>	-2.126 361	-2.126 <mark>039</mark>
4	-1.996 <mark>153</mark>	-1.996 43	-1.996 <mark>153</mark>
5	-1.946 <mark>3</mark>	-1.946 7	-1.946 <mark>3</mark>

Comparison of the excited state energies E_k (with errors in the last significant digit) of

Ar $_3$ in D = 2, 3 and 4 dimensions.

Numerical results: excited states Ar₄

k	D=3	D = 5
2	-4.800 897 73	-4.800 897 75
3	-4.725 156 7	-4.725 156 6
4	-4.630 025	-4.630 025
5	-4.586 389	-4.586 384

Comparison of the excited state energies E_k (with errors in the last significant digit) of

Ar $_4$ in D = 3 and 5 dimensions.

Schrödinger equation for an N particle cluster in D spatial dimensions has ND variables.

- Schrödinger equation for an N particle cluster in D spatial dimensions has ND variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than ND variables.

- Schrödinger equation for an N particle cluster in D spatial dimensions has ND variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than ND variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{ij} = r_{ji}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N 1$.

- Schrödinger equation for an N particle cluster in D spatial dimensions has ND variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than ND variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{ij} = r_{ji}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N 1$.
- Consider more general *D*-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$\left(-\sum_{i=1}^{N}\frac{1}{2m_{i}}\nabla_{i}^{2}+V\right)\psi=E\psi$$

- Schrödinger equation for an N particle cluster in D spatial dimensions has ND variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than ND variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{ij} = r_{ji}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N 1$.
- Consider more general *D*-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$\left(-\sum_{i=1}^{N}\frac{1}{2m_{i}}\nabla_{i}^{2}+V\right)\psi=E\psi$$

Rotationally and translationally invariant potential, not necessarily a sum two-body contributions.

- Schrödinger equation for an N particle cluster in D spatial dimensions has ND variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than ND variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{ij} = r_{ji}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N 1$.
- Consider more general *D*-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$\left(-\sum_{i=1}^{N}\frac{1}{2m_{i}}\nabla_{i}^{2}+V\right)\psi=E\psi$$

- Rotationally and translationally invariant potential, not necessarily a sum two-body contributions.
- Mass of each particle may be different.

• Apply differential operator identity

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} = \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{\partial r_{ij}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{ij}}$$

• Apply differential operator identity

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} = \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{\partial r_{ij}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{ij}}$$

$$\nabla_i^2 = \sum_{j \neq i} a_{i;j} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{ij}} + \sum_{j,k \neq i} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial r_{ij} \partial r_{ik}}$$

where

• Apply differential operator identity

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} = \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{\partial r_{ij}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{ij}}$$

• to obtain

$$\nabla_i^2 = \sum_{j \neq i} a_{i;j} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{ij}} + \sum_{j,k \neq i} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial r_{ij} \partial r_{ik}}$$

where

$$a_{i;j} = \sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial^2 r_{ij}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^2} = \frac{D-1}{r_{ij}}$$

$$g_{i;jk} = \sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial r_{ij}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial r_{ik}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} = \frac{\mathbf{r}_{ij} \cdot \mathbf{r}_{ik}}{r_{ij}r_{ik}} \quad \text{angle: no } D \text{ dependence}$$

In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D
 - 2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of D

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D
 - 2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of D
- Transform Schrödinger equation so that

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D
 - 2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of D
- Transform Schrödinger equation so that
 - 1. second-order operator is unchanged

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D
 - 2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of D
- Transform Schrödinger equation so that
 - 1. second-order operator is unchanged
 - 2. linear operator is absent

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D
 - 2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of D
- Transform Schrödinger equation so that
 - 1. second-order operator is unchanged
 - 2. linear operator is absent
 - 3. potential is modified by a additional term

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with
 - 1. linear differential operator depending on D
 - 2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of D
- Transform Schrödinger equation so that
 - 1. second-order operator is unchanged
 - 2. linear operator is absent
 - 3. potential is modified by a additional term

Use

$$\mathbf{H}\psi = E\psi \to \mathbf{H}'\phi = E\phi$$

with

$$\psi = \chi \phi$$
 and $\mathbf{H'} = \frac{1}{\chi} \mathbf{H} \chi$

Result for general χ special case of Eq. (3.8) of Ref. [3] [J. Avery, D. G. Goodson, and D. R. Herschbach, Theor. Chim. Acta **81**, 1 (1991)]

$$\mathbf{H}' = V - \sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{1}{2m_i} (S_i + T_i + U_i)$$

with

$$S_i = \sum_{j,k \neq i} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial r_{ij} \partial r_{ik}},$$

$$T_{i} = \sum_{j \neq i} \left(a_{i;j} + 2 \sum_{k \neq i} g_{i;jk} \chi^{-1} \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial r_{ik}} \right) \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{ij}},$$

and a "centrifugal" contribution to the effective potential

$$U_{i} = \sum_{j \neq i} a_{i;j} \chi^{-1} \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial r_{ij}} + \sum_{j,k \neq i} g_{i;jk} \chi^{-1} \frac{\partial^{2} \chi}{\partial r_{ik} \partial r_{ik}}$$

• Define N matrices of order N-1

$$\hat{G}_i = (r_{ij}g_{i;jk}r_{ik})_{j,k\neq i},$$

the Grammian associated with the N - 1 vectors \mathbf{r}_{ij} with $j = 1, \ldots, i - 1, i + 1, \ldots, N$.

• Define N matrices of order N-1

$$\hat{G}_i = (r_{ij}g_{i;jk}r_{ik})_{j,k\neq i},$$

the Grammian associated with the N - 1 vectors \mathbf{r}_{ij} with $j = 1, \ldots, i - 1, i + 1, \ldots, N$.

 Volume squared of the parallelepiped formed by the vectors from particle i to all other particles:

$$\omega = \det\left(\hat{G}_i\right)$$

• Define N matrices of order N-1

$$\hat{G}_i = (r_{ij}g_{i;jk}r_{ik})_{j,k\neq i},$$

the Grammian associated with the N - 1 vectors \mathbf{r}_{ij} with $j = 1, \ldots, i - 1, i + 1, \ldots, N$.

 Volume squared of the parallelepiped formed by the vectors from particle i to all other particles:

$$\omega = \det\left(\hat{G}_i\right)$$

• Linear differential operators T_i vanish for the choice

$$\chi = \omega^{(1-D)/4}$$

Contributions to effective potential

$$U_{i} = \frac{1}{8} [(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{ij}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{ij}}$$
$$= \frac{(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}}{16\omega^{2}} \sum_{j,k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ij}} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ik}}.$$

Contributions to effective potential

$$U_{i} = \frac{1}{8} [(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{ij}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{ij}}$$
$$= \frac{(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}}{16\omega^{2}} \sum_{j,k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ij}} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ik}}.$$

• Amplitude is symmetric in D about D = N.

Contributions to effective potential

$$U_{i} = \frac{1}{8} [(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{ij}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{ij}}$$
$$= \frac{(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}}{16\omega^{2}} \sum_{j,k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ij}} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ik}}$$

- Amplitude is symmetric in D about D = N.
- Schrödinger equation has the same energy eigenvalues in D = N 1 and D = N + 1.

Contributions to effective potential

$$U_{i} = \frac{1}{8} [(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{ij}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{ij}}$$
$$= \frac{(N-1)^{2} - (N-D)^{2}}{16\omega^{2}} \sum_{j,k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ij}} g_{i;jk} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{ik}}$$

- Amplitude is symmetric in D about D = N.
- Schrödinger equation has the same energy eigenvalues in D = N 1 and D = N + 1.
- Energy minimum at D = N. (Last sum is sum of squares because $g_{i;jk}$ is an inner product.)

• Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N - 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N - 1)N$ variables.

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on *D* contained in an effective potential energy.

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on *D* contained in an effective potential energy.
- *D* can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on D contained in an effective potential energy.
- *D* can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an *N*-body cluster in D = N 1 and D = N + 1 dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu *et al.*[5].

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on *D* contained in an effective potential energy.
- *D* can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an *N*-body cluster in D = N 1 and D = N + 1 dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu *et al.*[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension D = N.

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on *D* contained in an effective potential energy.
- *D* can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an *N*-body cluster in D = N 1 and D = N + 1 dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu *et al.*[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension D = N.
- Inter-dimensional degeneracy provides a powerful check of the validity of

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on *D* contained in an effective potential energy.
- *D* can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an *N*-body cluster in D = N 1 and D = N + 1 dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu *et al.*[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension D = N.
- Inter-dimensional degeneracy provides a powerful check of the validity of
 - 1. computer code

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for *S*-states of *N*-particle clusters in $D \ge N 1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N 1)N$ variables.
- Dependence on *D* contained in an effective potential energy.
- *D* can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an N-body cluster in D = N 1 and D = N + 1 dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu *et al.*[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension D = N.
- Inter-dimensional degeneracy provides a powerful check of the validity of
 - 1. computer code
 - 2. estimates of systematic and statistical errors

• Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1)N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \ge N-1$.

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1)N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \ge N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for D < N 1 and is symmetric about D = N.

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1)N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \ge N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for D < N 1 and is symmetric about D = N.
- The same applies to the spectrum.

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1)N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \ge N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for D < N 1 and is symmetric about D = N.
- The same applies to the spectrum.
- Continuation unrelated to physical spectrum of N particle clusters for $D \leq N 1$.

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1)N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \ge N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for D < N 1 and is symmetric about D = N.
- The same applies to the spectrum.
- Continuation unrelated to physical spectrum of N particle clusters for $D \le N 1$.
- Fundamental problem with the work by Gonzalez and Leal[6]: 1/D expansion estimates of energy levels of Lennard-Jones clusters in D = 3 with N = 3, 4, ..., 7 and 13 obtined by analytic continuation from large D.

Bibliography

References

- [1] J. de Boer, *Physica*, 14, 139 (1948)
- [2] D. M. Ceperley and B. Bernu, J. Chem. Phys., 89, 6316 (1988)
- [3] J. Avery, D. G. Goodson, and D. R. Herschbach, Theor. Chim. Acta 81, 1 (1991)
- [4] Q. Shi and S. Kais, J. Chem. Phys. 120, 2199 (2004) and references therein
- [5] Xiao–Yan Gu, Zhong–Qi Ma and Jian–Qiang Sun, *Europhys. Lett.*, **5**, 586 (2003)
- [6] A. Gonzalez and D. Leal, J. Phys. B: At. Mol. Opt. Phys., 26, 1253 (1993)