# Inter-dimensional degeneracies in van der Waals clusters 

Peter Nightingale<br>nightingale@phys.uri.edu<br>Department of Physics<br>Kingston, RI 02881, USA

## Abstract

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of $S$-states of $N$ particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in $N-1$ and $N+1$ spatial dimensions.


## Abstract

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of $S$-states of $N$ particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in $N-1$ and $N+1$ spatial dimensions.
- We derive this result exactly by showing that for spatial dimension $D \geq N-1$ the Schrödinger equation can be transformed into an differential equation with the $D$ as a parameter.


## Abstract

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of $S$-states of $N$ particle van der Waals clusters reveal identity of the spectra in $N-1$ and $N+1$ spatial dimensions.
- We derive this result exactly by showing that for spatial dimension $D \geq N-1$ the Schrödinger equation can be transformed into an differential equation with the $D$ as a parameter.
- $D$ appears only in an effective potential that is symmetric in $D$ about $D=N$.


## Abstract

- Quantum Monte Carlo results for energies of $S$-states of $N$ particle van der Walls clusters reveal identity of the spectra in $N-1$ and $N+1$ spatial dimensions.
- We derive this result exactly by showing that for spatial dimension $D \geq N-1$ the Schrödinger equation can be transformed into an differential equation with the $D$ as a parameter.
- $D$ appears only in an effective potential that is symmetric in $D$ about $1=N$.

${ }^{L A} T_{E} X$ with prosper. sty does it all. (prosper.scourceforge.net)


## Basic definitions

- $N$ atom cluster in $D$ dimensions; positions given by $D \times N$ matrix of Cartesian coordinates

$$
\mathbf{R}=\left(\mathbf{r}_{1} \mathbf{r}_{2} \ldots \mathbf{r}_{N}\right)
$$

with

$$
\mathbf{r}_{i}=\left(\begin{array}{c}
x_{1 i} \\
\vdots \\
x_{D i}
\end{array}\right)
$$

## Basic definitions

- $N$ atom cluster in $D$ dimensions; positions given by $D \times N$ matrix of Cartesian coordinates

$$
\mathbf{R}=\left(\mathbf{r}_{1} \mathbf{r}_{2} \ldots \mathbf{r}_{N}\right)
$$

with

$$
\mathbf{r}_{i}=\left(\begin{array}{c}
x_{1 i} \\
\vdots \\
x_{D i}
\end{array}\right)
$$

- Define difference vectors and their lengths

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{r}_{i j} & =\mathbf{r}_{j}-\mathbf{r}_{i} \\
r_{i j} & =\left|\mathbf{r}_{i j}\right|
\end{aligned}
$$

## Basic definitions

- Dimensionless Hamiltonian of $N$ bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass $\mu$

$$
H=-\frac{1}{2 m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_{i}^{2}+\sum_{(i, j)} V\left(r_{i j}\right),
$$

## Basic definitions

- Dimensionless Hamiltonian of $N$ bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass $\mu$

$$
H=-\frac{1}{2 m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_{i}^{2}+\sum_{(i, j)} V\left(r_{i j}\right),
$$

- with

$$
\nabla_{i}^{2}=\sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^{2}}
$$

## Basic definitions

- Dimensionless Hamiltonian of $N$ bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass $\mu$

$$
H=-\frac{1}{2 m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_{i}^{2}+\sum_{(i, j)} V\left(r_{i j}\right),
$$

- with

$$
\nabla_{i}^{2}=\sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^{2}}
$$

- Dimensionless Lennard-Jones potential $V$

$$
V(r)=\frac{1}{r^{12}}-\frac{2}{r^{6}} .
$$

## Basic definitions

- Dimensionless Hamiltonian of $N$ bosonic van der Waals atoms with atomic mass $\mu$

$$
H=-\frac{1}{2 m} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \nabla_{i}^{2}+\sum_{(i, j)} V\left(r_{i j}\right),
$$

- with

$$
\nabla_{i}^{2}=\sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^{2}}
$$

- Dimensionless Lennard-Jones potential $V$

$$
V(r)=\frac{1}{r^{12}}-\frac{2}{r^{6}} .
$$

- Inverse dimensionless mass is $m^{-1}=\hbar^{2} / 2^{\frac{1}{3}} \mu \sigma^{2} \epsilon$ proportional to the square of the de Boer parameter[1]; $\epsilon$ and $\sigma$ the standard Lennard-Jones parameters. [J. de Boer, Physica, 14, 139 (1948)]


## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Generate a sample of configurations $\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}(\sigma=1, \ldots, s)$ from a relative probability density function $\psi_{g}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}$.


## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Generate a sample of configurations $\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}(\sigma=1, \ldots, s)$ from a relative probability density function $\psi_{g}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions $\beta_{i}$ with non-linear variational parameters.


## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Generate a sample of configurations $\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}(\sigma=1, \ldots, s)$ from a relative probability density function $\psi_{g}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions $\beta_{i}$ with non-linear variational parameters.
- Re-weighted functions defined as $\hat{\beta}_{i}(R)=\psi_{g}(R)^{-1} \beta_{i}(R)$ and $\hat{\beta}_{i}^{\prime}(R)=\psi_{g}(R)^{-1} H \beta_{i}(R)$ for least-squares.


## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Generate a sample of configurations $\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}(\sigma=1, \ldots, s)$ from a relative probability density function $\psi_{g}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions $\beta_{i}$ with non-linear variational parameters.
- Re-weighted functions defined as $\hat{\beta}_{i}(R)=\psi_{g}(R)^{-1} \beta_{i}(R)$ and $\hat{\beta}_{i}^{\prime}(R)=\psi_{g}(R)^{-1} H \beta_{i}(R)$ for least-squares.
- In theory, for a complete set of elementary basis functions $\beta_{i}$ the Schrödinger equation becomes

$$
\hat{\beta}_{i}^{\prime}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)=\sum_{j=1}^{n} \hat{\beta}_{j}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right) \mathcal{E}_{j i} .
$$

## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Generate a sample of configurations $\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}(\sigma=1, \ldots, s)$ from a relative probability density function $\psi_{g}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}$.
- Trial wave functions are linear combinations of elementary basis functions $\beta_{i}$ with non-linear variational parameters.
- Re-weighted functions defined as $\hat{\beta}_{i}(R)=\psi_{g}(R)^{-1} \beta_{i}(R)$ and $\hat{\beta}_{i}^{\prime}(R)=\psi_{g}(R)^{-1} H \beta_{i}(R)$ for least-squares.
- In theory, for a complete set of elementary basis functions $\beta_{i}$ the Schrödinger equation becomes

$$
\hat{\beta}_{i}^{\prime}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)=\sum_{j=1}^{n} \hat{\beta}_{j}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right) \mathcal{E}_{j i} .
$$

- In practice, solve for matrix $\mathcal{E}$ in least-squares sense on Monte Carlo sample. Reproduces stationarity of energy w.r.t. linear parameters for infinite sample.


## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Optimal linear combinations of the basis functions $\beta_{i}$ computed by spectral decomposition of $\mathcal{E}$ :

$$
\mathcal{E}_{i j}=\sum_{k=1}^{n} d_{i}^{k} \tilde{E}_{k} \hat{d}_{j}^{k}
$$

with $\hat{d}_{j}^{k}$ and $d_{i}^{k}$ left and right eigenvectors of $\mathcal{E}$ with eigenvalues $\tilde{E}_{k}$.

## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Optimal linear combinations of the basis functions $\beta_{i}$ computed by spectral decomposition of $\mathcal{E}$ :

$$
\mathcal{E}_{i j}=\sum_{k=1}^{n} d_{i}^{k} \tilde{E}_{k} \hat{d}_{j}^{k}
$$

with $\hat{d}_{j}^{k}$ and $d_{i}^{k}$ left and right eigenvectors of $\mathcal{E}$ with eigenvalues $\tilde{E}_{k}$.

- Yield: trial functions

$$
\tilde{\psi}^{k}=\sum_{i=1}^{n} d_{i}^{k} \beta_{i}
$$

## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Non-linear parameters of the $\beta_{i}$ are optimized by minimizing the variance of the local energy of the linearly optimized $\tilde{\psi}^{k}$

$$
\chi^{2}=\frac{\sum_{\sigma=1}^{s}\left[\hat{\psi}^{k \prime}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)-\tilde{E}_{k} \hat{\psi}^{k}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)\right]^{2}}{\sum_{\sigma=1}^{s} \hat{\psi}^{k}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}}
$$

where $\hat{\psi}^{k}=\psi_{g}^{-1} \tilde{\psi}^{k}$ and $\hat{\psi}^{k \prime}=\psi_{g}^{-1} H \tilde{\psi}^{k}$.

## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Non-linear parameters of the $\beta_{i}$ are optimized by minimizing the variance of the local energy of the linearly optimized $\tilde{\psi}^{k}$

$$
\chi^{2}=\frac{\sum_{\sigma=1}^{s}\left[\hat{\psi}^{k \prime}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)-\tilde{E}_{k} \hat{\psi}^{k}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)\right]^{2}}{\sum_{\sigma=1}^{s} \hat{\psi}^{k}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}}
$$

where $\hat{\psi}^{k}=\psi_{g}^{-1} \tilde{\psi}^{k}$ and $\hat{\psi}^{k \prime}=\psi_{g}^{-1} H \tilde{\psi}^{k}$.

- For each choice of the non-linear parameters, new optimized linear parameters have to be computed:


## Monte Carlo trial function optimization

- Non-linear parameters of the $\beta_{i}$ are optimized by minimizing the variance of the local energy of the linearly optimized $\tilde{\psi}^{k}$

$$
\chi^{2}=\frac{\sum_{\sigma=1}^{s}\left[\hat{\psi}^{k \prime}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)-\tilde{E}_{k} \hat{\psi}^{k}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)\right]^{2}}{\sum_{\sigma=1}^{s} \hat{\psi}^{k}\left(\mathbf{R}_{\sigma}\right)^{2}}
$$

where $\hat{\psi}^{k}=\psi_{g}^{-1} \tilde{\psi}^{k}$ and $\hat{\psi}^{k \prime}=\psi_{g}^{-1} H \tilde{\psi}^{k}$.

- For each choice of the non-linear parameters, new optimized linear parameters have to be computed:
- full optimization of all parameters consists of a linear optimization nested in a non-linear one.


## Numerical results: three-body case

|  | $\mathrm{Kr}_{3}$ |  | $\mathrm{Ar}_{3}$ |  | $\frac{1}{2}-\mathrm{Ne}_{3}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $D$ | $E_{1}$ | $\Delta E_{1}$ | $E_{1}$ | $\Delta E_{1}$ | $E_{1}$ | $\Delta E_{1}$ |
| 1 | -1.8725485476 | $-9 \times 10^{-1}$ | -1.73480871 | $-8 \times 10^{-1}$ | -0.895584 | $-4 \times 10^{-1}$ |
| 2 | -2.7604613515 | $2 \times 10^{-10}$ | -2.55295322 | $-1 \times 10^{-9}$ | -1.302484 | $-7 \times 10^{-7}$ |
| 3 | -2.7605552787 | $6 \times 10^{-10}$ | -2.55328943 | $1 \times 10^{-8}$ | -1.308442 | $9 \times 10^{-6}$ |
| 4 | -2.7604613513 | $-5 \times 10^{-11}$ | -2.55295322 | $-1 \times 10^{-9}$ | -1.302483 | $-2 \times 10^{-6}$ |
| 5 | -2.7601795698 | $-1 \times 10^{-9}$ | -2.55194461 | $-2 \times 10^{-8}$ | -1.284627 | $-1 \times 10^{-5}$ |
| 6 | -2.7597099376 | $5 \times 10^{-10}$ | -2.55026364 | $7 \times 10^{-9}$ | -1.254901 | $5 \times 10^{-6}$ |

Ground state energies $E_{1}$ (with errors in the last significant digit) and deviations from quadratic fits $\Delta E_{1}$ for $\mathrm{Kr}_{3}, \mathrm{Ar}_{3}$ and $\frac{1}{2}-\mathrm{Ne}_{3}$ in dimensions $D=1$ through $D=6$.

## Numerical results: four-body case

| $D$ | $E_{1}$ | $\Delta E_{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | -2.62562256 | $-2 \times 10^{-0}$ |
| 2 | -4.32951795 | $-8 \times 10^{-1}$ |
| 3 | -5.11814605 | $-2 \times 10^{-9}$ |
| 4 | -5.11865384 | $3 \times 10^{-9}$ |
| 5 | -5.11814605 | $-2 \times 10^{-9}$ |
| 6 | -5.11662270 | $1 \times 10^{-9}$ |

Ground state energies (with errors in the last significant digit) and deviations from quadratic fits $\Delta E_{1}$ for $\operatorname{Ar}_{4}$ in dimensions $D=1$ through $D=6$.

## Numerical results: excited states $\mathrm{Ar}_{3}$

| $k$ | $D=2$ | $D=3$ | $D=4$ |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2 | -2.2498602 | -2.2501855 | -2.249860 |
| 3 | -2.1260388 | -2.126361 | -2.126039 |
| 4 | -1.996153 | -1.99643 | -1.996153 |
| 5 | -1.9463 | -1.9467 | -1.9463 |

Comparison of the excited state energies $E_{k}$ (with errors in the last significant digit) of $\mathrm{Ar}_{3}$ in $D=2,3$ and 4 dimensions.

## Numerical results: excited states $\mathrm{Ar}_{4}$

| $k$ | $D=3$ | $D=5$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2 | -4.80089773 | -4.80089775 |
| 3 | -4.7251567 | -4.7251566 |
| 4 | -4.630025 | -4.630025 |
| 5 | -4.586389 | -4.586384 |

Comparison of the excited state energies $E_{k}$ (with errors in the last significant digit) of $\mathrm{Ar}_{4}$ in $D=3$ and 5 dimensions.

## Exact results

- Schrödinger equation for an $N$ particle cluster in $D$ spatial dimensions has $N D$ variables.


## Exact results

- Schrödinger equation for an $N$ particle cluster in $D$ spatial dimensions has $N D$ variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than $N D$ variables.


## Exact results

- Schrödinger equation for an $N$ particle cluster in $D$ spatial dimensions has $N D$ variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than $N D$ variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{i j}=r_{j i}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N-1$.


## Exact results

- Schrödinger equation for an $N$ particle cluster in $D$ spatial dimensions has $N D$ variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than $N D$ variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{i j}=r_{j i}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N-1$.
- Consider more general $D$-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$
\left(-\sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{1}{2 m_{i}} \nabla_{i}^{2}+V\right) \psi=E \psi
$$

## Exact results

- Schrödinger equation for an $N$ particle cluster in $D$ spatial dimensions has $N D$ variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than $N D$ variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{i j}=r_{j i}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N-1$.
- Consider more general $D$-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$
\left(-\sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{1}{2 m_{i}} \nabla_{i}^{2}+V\right) \psi=E \psi
$$

- Rotationally and translationally invariant potential, not necessarily a sum two-body contributions.


## Exact results

- Schrödinger equation for an $N$ particle cluster in $D$ spatial dimensions has $N D$ variables.
- Wave functions invariant under rotations and translations depend on fewer than $N D$ variables.
- Choose lengths of all distinct inter-particle distances $r_{i j}=r_{j i}$ with $i \neq j$; independent variables if $D \geq N-1$.
- Consider more general $D$-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$
\left(-\sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{1}{2 m_{i}} \nabla_{i}^{2}+V\right) \psi=E \psi
$$

- Rotationally and translationally invariant potential, not necessarily a sum two-body contributions.
- Mass of each particle may be different.


## Exact results

- Apply differential operator identity

$$
\frac{\partial}{\partial x_{\alpha i}}=\sum_{j \neq i} \frac{\partial r_{i j}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{i j}}
$$

## Exact results

- Apply differential operator identity

$$
\frac{\partial}{\partial x_{\alpha i}}=\sum_{j \neq i} \frac{\partial r_{i j}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{i j}}
$$

- to obtain

$$
\nabla_{i}^{2}=\sum_{j \neq i} a_{i ; j} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{i j}}+\sum_{j, k \neq i} g_{i, j k} \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r_{i j} \partial r_{i k}}
$$

where

## Exact results

- Apply differential operator identity

$$
\frac{\partial}{\partial x_{\alpha i}}=\sum_{j \neq i} \frac{\partial r_{i j}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{i j}}
$$

- to obtain

$$
\nabla_{i}^{2}=\sum_{j \neq i} a_{i ; j} \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{i j}}+\sum_{j, k \neq i} g_{i ; j k} \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r_{i j} \partial r_{i k}}
$$

where

$$
\begin{gathered}
a_{i ; j}=\sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial^{2} r_{i j}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}^{2}}=\frac{D-1}{r_{i j}} \\
g_{i ; j k}=\sum_{\alpha=1}^{D} \frac{\partial r_{i j}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}} \frac{\partial r_{i k}}{\partial x_{\alpha i}}=\frac{\mathbf{r}_{i j} \cdot \mathbf{r}_{i k}}{r_{i j} r_{i k}} \text { angle: no } D \text { dependence }
\end{gathered}
$$

## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with


## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$

## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$
2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of $D$

## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$
2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of $D$

- Transform Schrödinger equation so that


## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$
2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of $D$

- Transform Schrödinger equation so that

1. second-order operator is unchanged

## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$
2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of $D$

- Transform Schrödinger equation so that

1. second-order operator is unchanged
2. linear operator is absent

## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$
2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of $D$

- Transform Schrödinger equation so that

1. second-order operator is unchanged
2. linear operator is absent
3. potential is modified by a additional term

## Exact results

- In terms of inter-particle distances, the Schrödinger assumes a form with

1. linear differential operator depending on $D$
2. second-order differential operator and a potential energy independent of $D$

- Transform Schrödinger equation so that

1. second-order operator is unchanged
2. linear operator is absent
3. potential is modified by a additional term

- Use

$$
\mathbf{H} \psi=E \psi \rightarrow \mathbf{H}^{\prime} \phi=E \phi
$$

with

$$
\psi=\chi \phi \quad \text { and } \quad \mathbf{H}^{\prime}=\frac{1}{\chi} \mathbf{H} \chi
$$

## Exact results

Result for general $\chi$ special case of Eq. (3.8) of Ref. [3] [J. Avery, D. G. Goodson, and D. R. Herschbach, Theor. Chim. Acta 81, 1 (1991)]

$$
\mathbf{H}^{\prime}=V-\sum_{i=1} \frac{1}{2 m_{i}}\left(S_{i}+T_{i}+U_{i}\right)
$$

with

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{i}=\sum_{j, k \neq i} g_{i ; j k} \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r_{i j} \partial r_{i k}}, \\
T_{i}=\sum_{j \neq i}\left(a_{i ; j}+2 \sum_{k \neq i} g_{i ; j k} \chi^{-1} \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial r_{i k}}\right) \frac{\partial}{\partial r_{i j}},
\end{gathered}
$$

and a "centrifugal" contribution to the effective potential

$$
U_{i}=\sum_{j \neq i} a_{i ; j} \chi^{-1} \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial r_{i j}}+\sum_{j, k \neq i} g_{i ; j k} \chi^{-1} \frac{\partial^{2} \chi}{\partial r_{i k} \partial r_{i k}} .
$$

## Exact results

- Define $N$ matrices of order $N-1$

$$
\hat{G}_{i}=\left(r_{i j} g_{i ; j k} r_{i k}\right)_{j, k \neq i},
$$

the Grammian associated with the $N-1$ vectors $\mathbf{r}_{i j}$ with $j=1, \ldots, i-1, i+1, \ldots, N$.

## Exact results

- Define $N$ matrices of order $N-1$

$$
\hat{G}_{i}=\left(r_{i j} g_{i ; j k} r_{i k}\right)_{j, k \neq i},
$$

the Grammian associated with the $N-1$ vectors $\mathbf{r}_{i j}$ with
$j=1, \ldots, i-1, i+1, \ldots, N$.

- Volume squared of the parallelepiped formed by the vectors from particle $i$ to all other particles:

$$
\omega=\operatorname{det}\left(\hat{G}_{i}\right)
$$

## Exact results

- Define $N$ matrices of order $N-1$

$$
\hat{G}_{i}=\left(r_{i j} g_{i ; j k} r_{i k}\right)_{j, k \neq i},
$$

the Grammian associated with the $N-1$ vectors $\mathbf{r}_{i j}$ with
$j=1, \ldots, i-1, i+1, \ldots, N$.

- Volume squared of the parallelepiped formed by the vectors from particle $i$ to all other particles:

$$
\omega=\operatorname{det}\left(\hat{G}_{i}\right)
$$

- Linear differential operators $T_{i}$ vanish for the choice

$$
\chi=\omega^{(1-D) / 4} .
$$

## Exact results

- Contributions to effective potential

$$
\begin{aligned}
U_{i} & =\frac{1}{8}\left[(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}\right] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{i j}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} \\
& =\frac{(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}}{16 \omega^{2}} \sum_{j, k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} g_{i ; j k} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i k}}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Exact results

- Contributions to effective potential

$$
\begin{aligned}
U_{i} & =\frac{1}{8}\left[(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}\right] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{i j}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} \\
& =\frac{(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}}{16 \omega^{2}} \sum_{j, k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} g_{i ; j k} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i k}}
\end{aligned}
$$

- Amplitude is symmetric in $D$ about $D=N$.


## Exact results

- Contributions to effective potential

$$
\begin{aligned}
U_{i} & =\frac{1}{8}\left[(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}\right] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{i j}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} \\
& =\frac{(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}}{16 \omega^{2}} \sum_{j, k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} g_{i ; j k} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i k}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

- Amplitude is symmetric in $D$ about $D=N$.
- Schrödinger equation has the same energy eigenvalues in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$.


## Exact results

- Contributions to effective potential

$$
\begin{aligned}
U_{i} & =\frac{1}{8}\left[(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}\right] \sum_{j \neq i} \frac{1}{r_{i j}} \frac{\partial \log \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} \\
& =\frac{(N-1)^{2}-(N-D)^{2}}{16 \omega^{2}} \sum_{j, k \neq i} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i j}} g_{i ; j k} \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial r_{i k}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

- Amplitude is symmetric in $D$ about $D=N$.
- Schrödinger equation has the same energy eigenvalues in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$.
- Energy minimum at $D=N$. (Last sum is sum of squares because $g_{i ; j k}$ is an inner product.)


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.
- $D$ can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.
- $D$ can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an $N$-body cluster in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$ dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu et al.[5].


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.
- $D$ can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an $N$-body cluster in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$ dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu et al.[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension $D=N$.


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.
- $D$ can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an $N$-body cluster in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$ dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu et al.[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension $D=N$.
- Inter-dimensional degeneracy provides a powerful check of the validity of


## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.
- $D$ can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an $N$-body cluster in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$ dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu et al.[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension $D=N$.
- Inter-dimensional degeneracy provides a powerful check of the validity of

1. computer code

## Summary and discussion

- Transformed the Schrödinger equation for $S$-states of $N$-particle clusters in $D \geq N-1$ dimensions into equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ variables.
- Dependence on $D$ contained in an effective potential energy.
- $D$ can be made continuous, as in dimensional scaling studies.[4]
- Found inter-dimensional degeneracy of an $N$-body cluster in $D=N-1$ and $D=N+1$ dimensions, in agreement with work by Gu et al.[5].
- The minimum energy was observed to be at the dimension $D=N$.
- Inter-dimensional degeneracy provides a powerful check of the validity of

1. computer code
2. estimates of systematic and statistical errors

## Summary and discussion

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \geq N-1$.


## Summary and discussion

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \geq N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for $D<N-1$ and is symmetric about $D=N$.


## Summary and discussion

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \geq N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for $D<N-1$ and is symmetric about $D=N$.
- The same applies to the spectrum.


## Summary and discussion

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \geq N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for $D<N-1$ and is symmetric about $D=N$.
- The same applies to the spectrum.
- Continuation unrelated to physical spectrum of $N$ particle clusters for $D \leq N-1$.


## Summary and discussion

- Our transformation of the Schrödinger equation to a differential equation in $\frac{1}{2}(N-1) N$ independent variables is valid only for $D \geq N-1$.
- Resulting equation and its eigenvalue spectrum have an analytical continuation for $D<N-1$ and is symmetric about $D=N$.
- The same applies to the spectrum.
- Continuation unrelated to physical spectrum of $N$ particle clusters for $D \leq N-1$.
- Fundamental problem with the work by Gonzalez and Leal[6]: $1 / D$ expansion estimates of energy levels of Lennard-Jones clusters in $D=3$ with $N=3,4, \ldots, 7$ and 13 obained by analytic continuation from large $D$.


## Bibliography

## References

[1] J. de Boer, Physica, 14, 139 (1948)
[2] D. M. Ceperley and B. Bernu, J. Chem. Phys., 89, 6316 (1988)
[3] J. Avery, D. G. Goodson, and D. R. Herschbach, Theor. Chim. Acta 81, 1 (1991)
[4] Q. Shi and S. Kais, J. Chem. Phys. 120, 2199 (2004) and references therein
[5] Xiao-Yan Gu, Zhong-Qi Ma and Jian-Qiang Sun, Europhys. Lett., 5, 586 (2003)
[6] A. Gonzalez and D. Leal, J. Phys. B: At. Mol. Opt. Phys., 26, 1253 (1993)

